**Forest Systems Guidelines for reviewers**

**Manuscript title:**

**Manuscript ref.:**

These guidelines are meant to assist you to fill in the attached “reviewer list” and to formulate your detailed comments on a separate sheet. Your comments will assist the author(s) when revising the manuscript.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1- Is the subject of the paper within the general scope of the journal? (Yes /No). If No, please add a comment.\* |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Yes  | No, see comments |
|  |  |

 |
| 2- Is this a new and original contribution?  (1-unimportant, 9-very important)\* |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 |
|  |  |  |  |  |

 |
| 3- Does it have a local or general interest for an international reader?\* |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| * Very local and limited interest
 |  |
| * Local interest for a reader working in the same area/or system
 |  |
| * Interest for readers of a region
 |  |
| * General interest for a broad audience
 |  |

 |
| 4- Does the title reflect clearly and sufficiently the content?\* |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Yes  | No, see coments |
|  |  |

 |
| 5- Are the abstract and keywords informative?\* |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Yes  | No, see coments |
|  |  |

 |
| 6- Are the presentation, organization and length of the paper satisfactory?\* |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Yes  | No, see coments |
|  |  |

 |
| 7- Can you suggest any reductions of the paper or elimination of parts?\* |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| no  | Yes, see coments |
|  |  |

 |
| 8- Are the interpretations/conclusions justified by the data?\* |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Yes  | No, see coments |
|  |  |

 |
| 9- Are all the figures and tables necessary and acceptable?\* |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Yes  | No, see coments |
|  |  |

 |
| 10- Are the references appropriate and are they all necessary?\* |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Yes  | No, see coments |
|  |  |

 |
| 11- Is the quality of the English satisfactory?\* |

|  |
| --- |
| * Yes (only minor errors)
 |
| * No, a revision needed by a professional
 |
| * Not possible to evaluate
 |

 |
| 12. Recommendation | * Accepted
* Minor Revision
* Major Review
* Rejected
 |
| 13. General Comment\* |
| 14. Specific comments (you can upload a separate file)\* |

**\* Denotes required field**